We shall present preliminary findings from our investigation into various effects of the implementation of different pedagogical practices in an introductory differential equations course. In particular, we analyze gender differences and perceived student success versus measurable student success between two roughly equal sections of the same course taught in the same semester with nearly identical curricular material (textbook, homework, midterms and final exam) at a liberal arts college. The two sections were subjected to two different treatments (pedagogical styles) while student learning was assessed using identical instruments. Results are disaggregated by gender (of both the students and the instructors). (Received September 20, 2016)