Fix an integer $m > 1$. Let $E$ be an elliptic curve over $\mathbb{Q}$ with the property that $\#E(\mathbb{F}_p)$ is divisible by $m$ for all but finitely many primes $p$. While $E$ is isogenous to an elliptic curve $E'$ such that $\#E'(\mathbb{Q})_{\text{tors}}$ is divisible by $m$, but it may not be the case that $\#E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text{tors}}$ is divisible by $m$. Ordered by height, we show the probability that a curve with $m \mid \#E(\mathbb{F}_p)$ also has $m \mid \#E(\mathbb{Q})_{\text{tors}}$ is nonzero and we compute the probability explicitly in several cases. This is joint work with John Voight. (Received September 14, 2018)